

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

B R I G H T O N
H I S T O R I C
P R E S E R V A T I O N
C O M M I S S I O N

September 24th, 2020
At approximately 7:15 p.m.
Brighton Town Hall, Zoom meeting
2300 Elmwood Avenue
Rochester, New York 14618

PRESENT:

JERRY LUDWIG, CHAIRPERSON

AMANDA L. DREHER)
WAYNE GOODMAN)
JOHN PAGE)
DIANA ROBINSON) BOARD MEMBERS
DAVID WHITAKER)

MARY JO LANPHEAR
Town Historian

KEN GORDON, ESQ.
Town Attorney

RAMSEY A. BOEHNER
Town Planner

NOT PRESENT:
JUSTIN DELVECCHIO

REPORTED BY: RHODA COLLINS, Court Reporter
FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES, LLC
21 Woodcrest Drive
Batavia, New York 14020

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 MR. BOEHNER: There will be two people for the
4 open forum, one of them is Diana, and Marjorie Searl is on.
5 I know she wants to speak so we should allow her to.

6 MARJORIE SEARL: Hi. Thank you for letting us
7 join you tonight. So I have an explanation of why we are
8 here. Shall I just go ahead and read it?

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Please.

10 MARJORIE SEARL: Regarding 124 Summit Drive,
11 recently a painter was doing some exterior touch-up work
12 brought to our attention that the exterior wood molding of
13 our five-bay bow window in the south wall of the kitchen felt
14 soft. This was the same situation that had prompted us to
15 apply to the Preservation Board last year to replace our
16 second story north facing window, for which we received a
17 certificate of appropriateness.

18 The painter investigated the situation by
19 removing the interior drywall beneath one of the windows and
20 discovered, sadly, that water had been coming in through the
21 windows and caused some of the wood to rot below.

22 At that time we contacted our architect, Jim
23 Durfey, who reviewed the situation and indicated that we were
24 going to need a contractor to do some repair work and that
25 the windows might need to be replaced but that we wouldn't

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 know until they could see what was going on by doing further
4 investigations.

5 At that point we made an effort to identify a
6 contractor -- and this has all been within the last couple
7 weeks. We made an effort to identify a contractor who could
8 do the work and could be able to fit it into his schedule.
9 Knowing that if it was true that the windows did need to be
10 replaced we needed to act quickly to contact the Preservation
11 Board in order to be in compliance.

12 Further investigation by the contractor
13 indicated that the windows were failing and were not being
14 well supported by the section of wall below. He removed the
15 windows to more fully examine the situation, and we all
16 agreed that the windows were compromised as well and we could
17 not put them back in. At that point we contacted Rochester
18 Colonial who provided us with the Marvin windows last year
19 and requested that they give us an estimate for replacing the
20 windows.

21 Our plan was and is, to get the same exterior
22 fiberglass/interior wood windows that had been installed last
23 year and repair the wall to match existing and paint the
24 windows to match existing.

25 Because we were facing at least a six- to

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 seven-week wait to get new windows it was necessary to have
4 the contractor remove any of the deteriorating wood and
5 secure the window opening against weather, animals, and human
6 entry. As it happened, we had just missed the deadline to
7 apply for tonight's meeting. So we are appearing at the open
8 forum to explain our situation and the need for us to move
9 ahead with ordering the windows so that the contractor can
10 complete the project before the snow flies.

11 To add to the excitement, we will be hosting
12 our two-year old and five-year old grandchildren and their
13 parents due to COVID circumstances over the next several
14 months. We're looking forward to having the wall and it's
15 point become intact. Thank you for helping us to expedite
16 this situation.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Marjorie, can I ask who
18 your contractor is?

19 MARJORIE SEARL: Pete Soole.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Who?

21 MARJORIE SEARL: Peter Soole.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay, thank you. Well,
23 we'll do what we can. You have already received permission
24 to use the same type of windows elsewhere, is that right?

25 MARJORIE SEARL: Yes.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Comments from
4 anyone?

5 MR. BOEHNER: Give you an update of where we
6 are. Glad that they called to set this when it happened,
7 project's due -- I think that that occurred, the best thing
8 you could do is call the town, which is what they did.

9 What I've done is I have extended the cut off
10 for the October HPC meeting, to try to help them get an
11 application in for a certificate of appropriateness. What we
12 need to do now is give them an indication that the window
13 choices they have would be acceptable to this group so they
14 can start moving forward and would have to go through the
15 certificate of appropriateness process in October.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you, Ramsey, for
17 extending the deadline. And if we approved the windows
18 before, I certainly don't see a problem with telling them to
19 go ahead and order the windows. Does anyone else?

20 MR. PAGE: So Ramsey --

21 MR. BOEHNER: I did explain that, but I do
22 feel that if we approved the windows in the past, it's good.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Right. John?

24 MR. PAGE: So Marjorie, the way I believe you
25 explained it is, you're going to be purchasing Marvin windows

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 that will be made and match the size of the windows that are
4 deteriorated. And you will be installing them in an opening
5 that is the same size as the opening as the windows are being
6 removed from.

7 MARJORIE SEARL: Right.

8 MR. PAGE: You're going to repair the exterior
9 with the same materials and paint everything up the same way;
10 is that correct?

11 MARJORIE SEARL: Right. Theoretically, there
12 shouldn't -- whoops.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Looks like you got some
14 firewood there.

15 MARJORIE SEARL: Theoretically -- well, not
16 even theoretically, yes, that is exactly what we are doing.

17 MR. PAGE: Okay, well, understanding that, I
18 don't see any problem. And I will just say that, we
19 appreciate that you guys have been good stewards of that
20 house. Apparently it needs that, and that the work that you
21 have done prior to this has been very good. And I would
22 expect this to go the same way.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, it's a contemporary
24 house with no overhang, that may have something to do with
25 it. But the joys of old house ownership, know them well.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3

So anyone else have any objection?

4

5

MR. WHITAKER: Based on the photographs she sent it's a serious problem and it's something that needs to be rectified.

6

7

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Absolutely.

8

9

MARJORIE SEARL: Yes, David, you are absolutely correct.

10

11

12

13

MR. GOODMAN: Reminds me a little bit of the Jane and Fran when they restored the Frank Lloyd Wright house. They started poking around a little bit, all of a sudden, uh-oh, here we go, put on the seatbelts.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Any ants?

MARJORIE SEARL: No, no. It was amazing, we did not see any. There were no insects that suddenly jumped out.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That's good.

MARJORIE SEARL: Yes. Wayne, you are right. You should never have somebody come over to do touch up work.

MR. GOODMAN: You can also look at it in the other way, it's a good thing you did, you know, or it could have been a real problem.

MARJORIE SEARL: Fortunately we have a painter who is very familiar with the house and so he's always

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 watching for any concerns.

4 MR. GOODMAN: Well, it's a beautiful house and
5 you have done a tremendous job in being incredible stewards.

6 MARJORIE SEARL: Thank you very much. So it
7 will be nice to try to get a wall together so the kids don't
8 sneak out. I think we're good, I think the contractor did a
9 very good job, you know, closing it up, so.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So any objections from
11 anyone on inviting Marjorie to go ahead?

12 MR. WHITAKER: No.

13 MR. PAGE: Bill, as I understand it they are
14 going to proceed that they will be back in October.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: This isn't -- I guess the
16 question is, does anyone have an objection for them going
17 ahead and ordering the windows?

18 MR. PAGE: Not under the criteria that's been
19 laid out, no.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Do we need to take
21 a vote, Ramsey?

22 MR. BOEHNER: So, no, this just happened. I
23 just asked very quickly for them to explain what happened.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

25 MR. BOEHNER: I have to say, these things do

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 occur quite a bit. The best thing you can do is get in
4 contact with the town and try to help them. I don't have any
5 way to acquire this.

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: So, Marjorie, one more
7 question, who is your painter?

8 MARJORIE SEARL: Jason Maclagger, he is -- I
9 can't say enough good things.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Great, okay, super.

11 MARJORIE SEARL: Thank you so much.

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you for coming in.

13 MR. BOEHNER: Follow up with Gretchen please,
14 and get everything in so we can get you going.

15 MARJORIE SEARL: Thanks so much. Buh-bye.

16 MR. GORDON: Jerry, if I could just pop in
17 here. This is Ken Gordon speaking. I will say, we do have
18 unique circumstances like this come up every now and then.
19 And it would be permissible under our Historic Prevention
20 Code, in fact, the code expressly allows the Commission to
21 establish rules or policies to determine when repairs or
22 maintenance of landmarks will not require a certificate of
23 appropriateness.

24 I don't know, Ramsey, if you want to give that
25 a little thought or somebody on the commission wants to give

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 a little thought to what criteria, what conditions, what
4 circumstances might lead us to allow someone in an emergency
5 situation, repairing with materials previously approved by
6 the Board, something along those lines, you might want to
7 have as a process.

8 I would rather that we have an established
9 process and not just do this in a very informal way.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: You can make repairs as
11 long as you're using like-kind materials and restoration. So
12 considering we already have approved windows, I guess this
13 could be --

14 MR. GORDON: It's not. And this is not
15 strictly a like-kind repair with like-kind materials. But
16 what I am saying is, it's permissible under your code, and
17 you would have to have a Public Hearing to create those
18 policies and procedures, which would in special circumstances
19 allow work to be done, which otherwise would require a C of A
20 to not require a C of A. And I think there are special
21 circumstances like this one that we should probably consider
22 create that policy or that procedure.

23 That's what I'm suggesting, rather than just
24 do it as we've just done it, on an informal basis. Just my
25 recommendation, it's up to the Board or up to staff to take

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 that up, but that would my recommendation.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yeah, it's a little
5 difficult, because we want to make sure that we have some
6 kind of control over what's going to go on. And in any
7 event, I think if there was a situation like this, they would
8 still have to come before us in some form or another.
9 Otherwise, I think we would loose that ability to make sure
10 that things are being done in a correct manner.

11 Now, obviously they secured the house or at
12 least the openings to prevent any further damage, but that's
13 going to be difficult, I think.

14 MR. BOEHNER: If you can give it some thought.
15 I am not sure exactly the wording of that or how that could
16 be properly implemented. Now, this thing, she had two window
17 charts when this whole thing started. I really, I was
18 wanting her to also be here to say, she was looking at maybe
19 doing an Anderson window and I needed guidance, I wasn't
20 comfortable. But I would be comfortable under a policy
21 choosing a window.

22 It's something I have to put some thought in.
23 See if I can do some research to see if I find policies out
24 there that will waive our process in emergency situations. I
25 think that's where Ken is as opposed to doing things

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 informal.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, regardless --

5 MR. BOEHNER: Then we'll have found a policy
6 that's been established by the Board and it all becomes very
7 clear.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Right. I think
9 regardless of the policy, I think we still need to be
10 apprised of what's going on and have some input as to
11 whatever --

12 MR. BOEHNER: And the policy could be written
13 in some way for that. Because on this one, even if there was
14 a policy, I don't know if I was going to make the windows --
15 without coming to you guys. I just don't think I would.

16 MR. GORDON: Right. And I can -- I'm sorry,
17 Ramsey, you and I can talk offline. We could shorten
18 noticing periods in our policy or procedure under special
19 circumstances, so that matters could come before the Board
20 like this one, once you get the Board's input. And not have
21 somebody hold off on actually ordering windows or doing work
22 that's necessary.

23 If you look at our code there is no emergency
24 repair balance, there's not. So if you have an emergency
25 with your designated property and you need to fix that

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 problem with something that is not like-kind material,
4 because maybe you can't get it, it's not available. You are
5 going to need to get a C of A and you're going to need at
6 least technically under the rules as they now exist, you have
7 to get it on the agenda and wait a month and have a Public
8 Hearing.

9 I'm suggesting that maybe we can shortcut that
10 in a formal way with a formal policy. So Ramsey and I will
11 talk. I saw John nodding his head or giving a thumb's up, so
12 maybe John's got some thoughts and ideas too.

13 MR. BOEHNER: My thought is we need an
14 emergency policy like John has said. Is there anything in
15 the code that could help the situation? We don't have
16 anything, and I would have loved to have something. When I
17 first talked to her she was panicked, I felt bad. I hate
18 having -- you want to help someone not have to be a
19 bureaucrat with them.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, Ramsey, you did
21 fine by extending the deadline. So, and by having her come
22 tonight and discussing approving the windows so they can be
23 ordered and then she can come back in October. So thank you,
24 Ramsey, for that.

25 MR. BOEHNER: Yeah, and me and Ken will talk

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 and figure something out.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Diana, I believe you're
5 on the podium.

6 MS. ROBINSON: Right. I think there's a
7 sketch but it doesn't really show much. We have been
8 chomping at this idea for many years now about solar panels
9 and solar installations. And, of course, I'm of mix. Yes, I
10 agree for the good of the world and all that, but I really
11 don't like to look at them. So but, he met this fellow and
12 the proposal seems too good to pass up. So I promised him I
13 would bring it before you.

14 The little sketch shows -- the numbers come
15 out I was totally surprised. The total cost of the thing
16 would be less than \$10,000 and it would give something like
17 50 percent of the electric that we use now, based on the
18 bills we have now, so we would save about \$1,000 a year.

19 That's really not here or there, other than
20 the numbers did surprise me. That there's two credits, a New
21 York State and a Federal credit, so the whole thing is less
22 than \$10,000.

23 Then, I said I would present it. I don't like
24 to look at them, so unfortunately this is the total south
25 side of the main roof of the house. What I've just done is

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 every time I drive home I tried to look and see if it
4 would -- if I was a driver in a car and as a driver, I
5 wouldn't know. I would not have a clue, I wouldn't care, I
6 wouldn't see it, I wouldn't even get a glimpse.

7 As a passenger looking out the window and
8 watching the scenery go by, I might look up and say oh, look
9 at that they have a solar roof. So I don't know, in one
10 hand, I don't like what they look like, on the other hand I
11 guess my argument in this direction is that they are
12 removable. It's something that goes over the shingle roof
13 and so essentially could be removed. So with that, similar
14 to how a paint color could be changed, I guess that would be
15 my argument for. That's about it.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, if you had to
17 replace your roof, I assume that you'd have to take the
18 panels off and put new shingles on and put the panels back;
19 is that right?

20 MS. ROBINSON: They would, that whole side of
21 the roof would be reroofed whether it needed it or not before
22 they put the panels on.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

24 MR. PAGE: I think in general I am a proponent
25 in any way of good things. Good things for preservation,

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 good things for energy, good things for the planet,
4 et cetera. Campbell-Whittlesey house didn't hesitate to go
5 after some sunshine. So you would be in good company that
6 way.

7 I don't think -- I mean, it might be a harder
8 situation if it was a barrel tile roof or something like
9 that, but given the way it, you know, a standard roof and
10 like you said these are removable at some point if somebody
11 didn't want them. So I have no problem with it, I think it's
12 a nice idea if you can live with it.

13 MS. ROBINSON: I don't like when you drive by
14 and somebody has them all on the front elevation porch where
15 you're driving by and they smack you in the eye. So I have
16 been looking -- unfortunately, it's a very simple roof, it's
17 just one big rectangle and I had looked into it a few years
18 ago just putting some on the pool house to heat the pool, but
19 it was not feasible. The only place you can do it in the
20 house is the south side of the roof, which is the main roof.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Do they have a life span?

22 MS. ROBINSON: I don't know. That's a good
23 question. He does say they lose a tiny percentage of
24 efficiency from year to year, over a 30-year period. Maximum
25 points of size per year through the year 30. So I guess he's

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 thinking they could stay there for 30 years. He's got it
4 right here, I am right. 30-year linear performance warranty,
5 25-year product warranty, and 30-year performance warranty.
6 Inverter carries a 12-year warranty, I guess that seems fair.

7 I was just surprised at the cost. Also the
8 other thing is, I don't know, they have a starting date. I
9 don't know if the starting date is when you sign a contract
10 or when they start work. But the Federal credit goes to
11 22 percent next year, and then 2022 it goes away, unless they
12 put it back again. But as of now, there's 22 percent next
13 year and zero after that.

14 MR. BOEHNER: I want to make you aware of
15 something else in the code. We do have a section which is
16 207-45 which is our solar energy systems regulations, you may
17 want to check into. I'm not sure, that's additional
18 regulations beyond having to come see the Commission with an
19 application [inaudible].

20 MS. ROBINSON: Okay.

21 MR. BOEHNER: I can help you with that.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Sounds like you want to
23 do it this year for sure. Since the tax credit, the Federal
24 tax credit decreases next year, is that right?

25 MS. ROBINSON: Well, that's my question. Is

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 signing the contract good enough to say that, you know, it's
4 a done deal? Or because still, it's still pushing it to find
5 a roofing contractor, and I don't know. And I guess it would
6 formally come before you, I don't even know what the
7 deadlines would be. We would formally have to come before
8 the Board before we finalized it, unless we just went ahead
9 and, you know, a winger like.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well --

11 MR. BOEHNER: Something, without a certificate
12 of appropriateness I would not be able to issue the building
13 permit of the installation of the panels.

14 MS. ROBINSON: Okay. So --

15 MR. BOEHNER: I think to be honest, you do
16 need to do research just because roofers are very, very tough
17 this time of year.

18 MS. ROBINSON: I know.

19 MR. BOEHNER: The pandemic made that even
20 tougher, and prices have gone up, right, Amanda? So you do
21 have some challenges ahead of you to try to get that work
22 done this year. It's just not our time schedule. But let us
23 know, because we do support solar in this community, if this
24 Board gives you an approval for the certificate of
25 appropriateness.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 MS. ROBINSON: Okay, so we can make a formal
4 application. I guess the worst thing that can happen is the
5 next year it's just a smaller credit or something. That
6 would be the biggest.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: It would make sense to
8 find out if you signed the contract, would that look at the
9 existing credit?

10 MS. ROBINSON: That's my question. But still,
11 we have to come before you, I guess that wouldn't be until
12 November now.

13 MR. BOEHNER: If you have drawings ready to
14 go --

15 MS. ROBINSON: There's no drawings, this is
16 scripted. They show you so many panels at such and such a
17 size and there you go.

18 MR. BOEHNER: So the certificate of
19 appropriateness would be appropriate to have something
20 showing replacement of the actual roof area. Also, you will
21 need drawings of showing load, and a bunch of stuff to get a
22 building permit. And you can't have the panels too close to
23 the top of the roof. There's some regulations that are going
24 to have to be shown met in order for us to issue the building
25 permit, much less the certificate of appropriateness.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3

MS. ROBINSON: Is that all in this 207.45?

4

5

MR. BOEHNER: No, that's in our official regulations, the certificate of appropriateness also requires a plan to be submitted.

6

7

8

9

10

MS. ROBINSON: All right. Just to say, I have been kind of holding back on this. I wasn't really -- I guess I'm talking myself into it. You guys sound a little encouraging, so I guess I'm talking myself into it.

11

12

Okay. I will pursue the guy and get all the rest of the information and make a formal application.

13

14

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Diana, if you don't want to do it we can take care of that.

15

16

17

MS. ROBINSON: I just don't like looking at them, but I can't see them and the price is so reasonable. It seems a lot different than I --

18

19

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, we can't see them from our house --

20

21

MS. ROBINSON: So there you go. Just keep your eyes on the road and you will never see them.

22

23

Okay. I will get more information and we'll make a formal application in November I guess.

24

25

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Good.

MS. ROBINSON: Thank you.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Is there anyone else for
4 open forum?

5 MR. BOEHNER: If they do, please raise your
6 hand, it's in the share the screen portion. Is there anyone
7 who wants to speak in the open forum, please raise your hand.

8 I'm not seeing any, Jerry.

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you. I'd like to
10 call the meeting to order. Ramsey, would you call the roll
11 please?

12 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Here.

14 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson?

15 MS. ROBINSON: Here.

16 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

17 MR. GOODMAN: Here.

18 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Whitaker?

19 MR. WHITAKER: Here.

20 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

21 MR. PAGE: Here.

22 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

23 MS. DREHER: Here.

24 MR. BOEHNER: Absent is Delvecchio.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: May I have a motion to

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 approve the agenda?

4 MR. PAGE: I will make a motion.

5 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Am I here? I don't know
6 if I am part of this group.

7 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, we haven't called the
8 application yet.

9 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Okay.

10 MR. BOEHNER: You're up next.

11 ANGELA PICHICHERO: I was worried, thank you.

12 MR. BOEHNER: By the way, I didn't know that
13 was you. I'm glad you said something. I was about to call
14 you by the way to make sure you were in.

15 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Okay.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Anyway, motion to approve
17 the agenda. We have a motion, do we have a second?

18 MR. WHITAKER: Second.

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

20 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: None opposed, agenda
22 approved.

23 The next item is the minutes from August 27th,
24 and it's a good thing I didn't print them out, I think they
25 were at 78 pages. Does anyone -- should I start or does

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 anyone else want to start?

4 MS. ROBINSON: I have a very small one,
5 Page 45, Line 6, I was speaking and it says Mary instead of
6 Jerry. There's no Mary it should be Jerry.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

8 MS. DREHER: I was actually, this is Amanda
9 Dreher, I didn't think that the open forum should be recorded
10 in the minutes. It didn't, it wasn't when we met in person.

11 MR. BOEHNER: No, it does not need to be, but
12 actually, Ken, does it? It does, the whole thing? Ken, your
13 on mute. I think the answer is yes, it does have to.

14 MS. DREHER: Okay.

15 MR. BOEHNER: Ken, unmute it.

16 MR. GORDON: My fault, sorry about that. I
17 was going through the 332 South Landing Road documents.

18 Yes, under the Governor's executive order we
19 had to transcribe everything that takes place during the Zoom
20 meetings.

21 MS. DREHER: Oh, so it's a different
22 regulation.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Most of these under, are
24 under Amanda, so she probably will agree or disagree. But
25 Page 3, Line 6, I think we're talking about Gilmore and it

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 said four inches, seven feet. I think it should be
4 seven feet, four inches.

5 MS. DREHER: Seven feet, and four inches, I
6 apologize, I didn't review the open forum comments because I
7 didn't think they needed to be.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Stand by --

9 MS. DREHER: I'm looking at them right now.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And Page 5, Line 7, it
11 says recorder glass. Does that make any sense, recorder
12 glass?

13 MS. DREHER: Three quarter glass.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Oh, three quarter not
15 recorder, okay. And Page 10, Line 20, I think it says if all
16 options, I think it should be of all options.

17 Page 11, Lines 4 and 5, small children are
18 going to be struck, I think it says stretch or struck or
19 scratched, I don't think we need all small children are going
20 to be struck, so I'm not quite sure what that means.

21 MS. DREHER: What page was that?

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Page 11, Lines 4 and 5,
23 small children are going to be struck, I think.

24 MS. DREHER: I don't recall what that was.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, small children --

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3

MS. DREHER: Oh, destructive.

4

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay, there you go.

5

Okay.

6

MS. DREHER: And they already are destructive.

7

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And Page 16, Line 8,

8

elevate? Is there such a window called elevate?

9

MS. DREHER: Yes, it's the collection they

10

have. It's the wood inside, fiberglass outside.

11

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. On Page 32,

12

Line 18, I think it should be grain not green.

13

Page 37, Line 14, should be standing seam

14

not -- steaming or something, standing seam for the roof.

15

MS. DREHER: Yes. Not scanning seam, the

16

standing seams.

17

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Page 45, Line 13,

18

I think it should be just one member not one number.

19

And Page 69, Line 15, moisture,

20

M-O-I-S-T-U-R-E, misspelling.

21

And on Page 71, Line 12, oh no, I am sorry

22

wrong one. This was Jim Keane, you're not -- are you doing

23

anything with Jim Keane? No, you're not. He's a stucco guy.

24

MS. DREHER: I thought Keane was on Page 69,

25

and Page 71, the references to King, I also believe they

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 should be Keane.

4 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes, K-E-A-N-E.

5 MS. DREHER: Per the letter that we got.

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. And, then, well,
7 are you going to talk more tonight about where you are?
8 Because you and I had a conversation off line about some
9 changes we talked about. Are you going to bring that up or
10 shall we continue until you're ready to go?

11 MS. DREHER: No, we are not ready to proceed
12 based on several things so, yeah.

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Well, if you get a
14 chance let's talk because I have other information for you.

15 MS. DREHER: Thank you.

16 MR. BOEHNER: Let's review the minutes if you
17 could.

18 MS. DREHER: I just have one or two more
19 changes on the 69 and 71, the references to Keane instead of
20 King. On Page 49, Line 21, and to Page 50, it did have a
21 correct spelling of Chabad-Lubivitch. I believe the correct
22 spelling was C as in cat, H-A, B as in boy, A, D as in dog.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I thought that was
24 corrected by Ken?

25 MS. DREHER: I believe the stenographer just

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 misheard Ken, just so we correct it in the record so we have
4 the right reference.

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

6 MS. DREHER: And the only one I had was
7 Page 52, Line 22, transit I believe should be transom window.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Any other
9 corrections?

10 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes, I've got a couple.
11 Page 43, Line 8, it's the Joseph Abbey house, not the Joseph
12 Anthony house. And Page 79, Line 6, it should be Katie
13 Eggers Comeau, not the name that's not pronounceable there.

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. Any other
15 corrections? Motion to approve the minutes as corrected.

16 MS. DREHER: I will move.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Second, please.

18 MS. ROBINSON: I will second.

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

20 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Opposed? Minutes stand
22 approved as corrected.

23 Was this meeting duly advertised, Ramsey?

24 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, it was properly advertised
25 in the Brighton-Pittsford Post of September 10, 2020.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That meeting as duly
4 advertised will now be held.

5 We have two communications, the first one is
6 from Mary Jo Lanphear dated 9/22 regarding 322 South Landing
7 Road. And we also have a letter from Angela Pichichero,
8 dated 9/23 regarding 322 South Landing Road.

9 First item on the agenda is Application
10 9H-01-20.

11 APPLICATION 9H-01-20

12 9H-01-20 Application of Mary Jo Lanphear, Town
13 Historian, for property owned by Angela Pichichero, at 332
14 South Landing Rd, tax number 138.05-2-77, for landmark
15 designation. All as described on application and documents
16 on file.

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: And I assume there's
18 someone here to speak on that.

19 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Yes, I am Angela
20 Pichichero.

21 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: For the record please
22 state your name and you have the floor.

23 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Thank you. I'm Angela
24 Pichichero and just for the record it's 332 South Landing
25 Road.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I didn't say that
4 correctly? I said 322.

5 ANGELA PICHICHERO: It's 332 and in my letter
6 to you I have my own correction. And for some reason in the
7 third line I said we are a historic reservation committee.
8 I -- it looks like preservation, and so I can fix that. I
9 think I did that twice. You are the preservation committee.

10 And so I am not sure exactly what it is that
11 you might want me to do tonight or what the procedure is. So
12 Mary Jo Lanphear wrote and I have a copy of it. And I have a
13 statement of situation that I wrote to you. And I don't know
14 whether you have a conversation, I don't know if you
15 questions, or I don't know whether you want me to have
16 questions?

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Ken, do you want to
18 respond to this?

19 MR. GORDON: Sure, I'd be happy to. Ms.
20 Pichichero, am I saying that correctly?

21 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Perfectly.

22 MR. GORDON: Thank you. Ms. Pichichero, first
23 of all, thank you very much for attending tonight. It's so
24 important to have our residents come to these meetings. What
25 you are here for I hope, and I trust, is to provide your

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 input at this Public Hearing on whether your home at
4 332 South Landing Road should be designated a landmark under
5 the Town's Historic Preservation Law.

6 And I think you had an opportunity to see the
7 papers prepared by Mary Jo Lanphear, to see the cultural
8 resources survey prepared in 2004 on the house and to see the
9 update that was prepared this past February by the Bero
10 Associates, all of which is before this Board tonight as part
11 of the record on the Public Hearing. We're hearing whether
12 your house should be designated.

13 So the way this works is this is your
14 opportunity to provide information, your testimony, or any
15 other documentation you wish to present to the Board to
16 present your side to whether you think your house should or
17 should not be a designated landmark under the Town's Historic
18 Preservation Law.

19 You're welcome to present anything that you
20 think is relevant to that issue. And the Board may have
21 questions for you, it is a process that really is for the
22 Board to receive your information, not so much for the Board
23 to respond to your questions. But if you have questions, we
24 will certainly try to address them as best we can.

25 So with that, I hope that explains where we

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 are in the process. You may, if you wish read your statement
4 to the Board. I think it has been circulated and it will be
5 made part of our record and it will be considered in the
6 Board's decision making.

7 So, in fact, there it is. Brett has just
8 shared it on our Zoom meeting window. So with that, I want
9 to turn it back over to the Chair of the Commission, Jerry
10 Ludwig, and ask if, you know, you Ms. Pichichero, want to
11 give your testimony at this time or present anything else.

12 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Okay, so it's Jerry
13 Ludwig?

14 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That's me.

15 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Okay. And so would you
16 address me at this point?

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Sure. Just a couple of
18 comments. First of all, I noticed that you have used a
19 couple of people, Jim Keane, I believe and also Charles Cook.
20 I am very familiar with both, they've done work on our house.
21 So I applaud you in getting the right people to do the job.
22 And John is giving a thumbs up to that.

23 The other thing is, I guess, I'd like to make
24 a couple statements before you go on, if that's okay. We are
25 very interested in assisting in any way we can with help in a

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 historic house, as you have seen earlier. I don't know
4 whether you tuned in, but there was a lady here earlier who
5 has a mid-century modern house and she has some windows.

6 And we all know -- and I live in a 1970
7 house -- 1917 house, and we all know older houses need
8 repairs and, but sensitive repair. And so one of the things
9 that the Board tries to do is to help people in that respect.

10 The other thing that was done several years
11 ago was we sort of did a little research in trying to
12 determine whether or not historic properties when they went
13 for sale, if the historic designation had a detrimental
14 effect on the resale value. And at that time we found that
15 every single property that had sold went for more than the
16 appraised value. So I don't think necessarily that historic
17 destination is a detriment. So with those two things in
18 mind, I'll turn it back to you.

19 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Okay. Well, thank you,
20 Jerry. And ironically the Board is meeting, I called
21 Marjorie Searl and told her that it was going to happen today
22 and she laughed and she said, well, you're going to hear me.

23 So yes, I don't know how well, but in the last
24 year we have been in a group together. I did not know she
25 had this historic house, and, but I did know that she has a

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 very significant knowledge base of preservation. And so I
4 wanted to get her input in regard to what she said about this
5 consideration of this house. It was just, you know, small
6 town kind of situation.

7 I want to be able to clarify some issues.
8 Some are maybe a little bit in terms of debate and other
9 things really need to be carefully looked at. For instance,
10 in the description of the house, Mary Jo Lanphear, she
11 actually did follow Katie Eggers Comeau's suggestions that
12 this house is an Italian Renaissance style house.

13 I actually called Roger Brown earlier this
14 afternoon and, I don't know his mother's name, he designed
15 the garage that fools everyone. Just for the record it was
16 listed but I had changed the original door to the historic
17 garage. I built this historic garage. So, yes, sir,
18 Barbarino, is that Roger Brown actually designed that garage
19 and Jim Keane built it. And Roger Brown designed my addition
20 on the back of the house and Jim Keane built it.

21 So and Jim Keane has done all of the interior
22 and exterior work on this house except for the roof where I
23 did have to engage the Cook company. And things will change,
24 he has retired. He will still come because I call him. He
25 reminds me that he's retired.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 So here are the situations in regards to, is
4 it policy designated here in these papers, that I have
5 received and you have received, that Italian Renaissance it
6 shocked Roger Brown. Because actually it's an Amalgam house.
7 It is a combination of craftsman mission, an elegant center
8 entrance colonial, and a broad wash historical basis.

9 You look very hard and far of an Italian
10 Renaissance style. By far, the furthest removed of the
11 rest of the presentation, of what the house actually looks
12 like, which is rust stucco, as opposed to smooth stucco of
13 Italian Renaissance, angled and not just a front but there
14 are buttresses all around the house of these -- these are
15 very, very specific documented across the country
16 particularly Chicago, Michigan, of the craftsman mission
17 style. So we have to fix that as a description because the
18 description of the house should actually, no matter what, be
19 accurate.

20 And then what I wanted to ask is that I have
21 always paid attention to this house, steward 40 years. So I
22 also appreciate the fact that it styled the
23 DeRidder-Pichichero house and I am still here. There are no
24 plans of departing, I am still the steward of this house. So
25 I'm completely engaged with it. And from day one is my MO

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 for this house.

4 So I don't really come to you with a yeah or a
5 nay or a duke-out situation. I want to do and continue to do
6 the right thing for the house. It wants to be taken care of
7 and it deserves to be taken care of and I want that to
8 continue to happen.

9 And when you tell me, Jerry, that there isn't
10 a relative monetary distinction between having a historic
11 house and its sale price versus not. There's something that
12 has happened to this house that is relatively dastardly, and
13 it is the cell tower. Nobody cares because you drive by. It
14 looms over my house. When I speak to someone on the phone,
15 now I'm in my beautiful dining room right now -- but most of
16 the time I am in my sun room, this addition, that is world
17 class. It looks out on a cell tower. That was nothing
18 before.

19 This is not a small deal for this house. The
20 duress that this house has -- am I still with you? Wow, oh,
21 bravo, bravo, okay. So there's one duress. I'm standing in
22 my addition inside, so I'm not even outside, and this is what
23 I'm looking at. The picture above it is another duress and
24 that is that if you go out on my wonderfully historic looking
25 garage and you stick out a long arm you might get hit by a

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 car. That's a little hypothetical and maybe a little
4 hyperbolic because there's a wall there, but the point I am
5 making is that you can feel every single car go by, every
6 single truck.

7 And if you were even sitting here with me
8 right now you would here the single car that goes by. You
9 also hear thousands of cars go by all day long. And of those
10 trucks that stop right after, so you see my house and then
11 there's Landing Road coming at the 441 and that's my turn in.
12 About a hundred feet further to your left there, is East
13 Avenue where people stop. So everybody is stopping, so all
14 of the stop noises are there, and all of the vibrations.

15 And this is where I want to speak to you about
16 my stucco. My stucco shakes every day. And if you look very
17 hard, I wanted to take a picture of it for you but it is hard
18 to get the clarity of it. It's disintegrating. It's
19 powdering off of the house. So now if you look at the
20 picture on the right, you can see where I have not had Jim
21 Keane do anything recently, but you can see that probably
22 next year or the year after, that's going to be a hole.
23 Because mold gets in there and if you stare hard at it you
24 can see the little cilia, the little hairs sticking out from
25 underneath that white stuff because there's moisture inside

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

there.

So on the left, and, oh, there, okay. So on the far left -- on the far right of the picture is the beginning of my addition, and on the right side where there's the light, you can see that it wants to fall off. It wants to fall off. And the dark part is where I've had recent repair where there were holes.

And, so I want to rant and rave about this, but there's something called honest repair. This house has never been painted. This house has never had anything applied to it but something called exposed aggregate. That's when you mix the stone into the -- get more excited about this -- the concrete, and you apply it onto the original lathe that is underneath the stucco. This is what Jim Keane does.

Now, I, so now we're looking at all these different areas where in the center picture you can see that white area that needs repair, and also on the far right, you can see it's whitish where the stones have fallen off, the layer of concrete is still there. And it isn't a hole yet because I have recently -- and it's \$5,000 per trip, of fixing the holes on Landing Road side.

Prior to me being in this house, on the far

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 left side you see two lines of kind of looks like gunky
4 concrete. That is how the previous owners fixed this house.
5 They did not do the exposed aggregate technique, they just
6 threw concrete into the cracks. It's not pretty.

7 So you know as well as I do that 10 Hawthorn
8 Street is for sale. It is an Arthur Headley house. I drove
9 there today and got out of my car and walked up to it and
10 touched it. And you see that they have, I don't know what
11 you call it painting or what, and nobody was there. And so I
12 have to -- these are things that could be discovered and you
13 might know them. That entire house including the chimneys
14 have been covered with a coating so that the entire house
15 looks the same. It has paint on it.

16 Jim Keane -- and so these are all of my
17 problems that I'm looking at. And if you look very close to
18 this one, I took it because you can see the little hairs of
19 algae inside, which eats concrete, which makes the rocks fall
20 out, which makes the holes happen.

21 So Ken Hawthorne fixed that problem and the
22 sister house of this house on 25 Harwood Lane in East
23 Rochester. Amazingly similar house, but has also some
24 characteristics of Ken Hawthorne, they're all looking a
25 little bit different, but also a lot the same. You know that

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

Arthur Headley built this or designed this.

So 25 Harwood Lane also painted itself.

There's something on it, I didn't have the nerve to park my car in their driveway and touch it. So anyway, we have got a scoop here that's no small deal. That is my, has been my scoop and my situation with Jim Keane, but it will change.

It must change because that original picture of 441 and where it sits, vis-a-vis my house has changed the tension that this house feels from the vibrations of vehicles. And so the cracks and the fissures are actually incrementally bigger and more often. Just saying, okay?

And, then, we have the issue of the tile roof. The tile roof is underlayment, but ice and water shield, is completely deteriorated. And you might know some people who have taken off their tile roof and put on their own tiles back, again like the house on the corner, a golf side, a parkway and Landing Road. They sold their house, they cry every day because it's impossible to do as Charles Cook very well knows, is to get all of those old tiles to fit together again in all these different configurations is nigh impossible.

If you have a hundred thousands dollars you can fix your roof with new Spanish tiles. You're welcome to

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 do it. But the house that Roger Brown told me about that
4 happens to also be on Hawthorne Street. You haven't looked
5 at it yet, are you nodding your head you know about it?

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No.

7 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Oh, okay. Is that it
8 replaced its tile roof with tile roof, with tiles that are
9 made out of steel.

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No, no.

11 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Now, so anyway, all I'm
12 saying and these are the three things that I wrote to you,
13 that are tremendous stressors on this house that are not
14 ordinary. They're not ordinary, they're very expensive. And
15 this house on the lot of 490, I mean you walk down to the
16 creek, you wave the trucks along. And then you walk along
17 the side, you can't wave to them now because they don't see
18 you, but they're very close by on 441. And certainly it's a
19 corner house of Landing Road. This is a particular
20 circumstance of this house that probably doesn't play a role
21 in most of your houses.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: That's right.

23 ANGELA PICHICHERO: It just needs to be
24 understood the stress of owning this house.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I logged you for

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 hanging in there and doing what you've done. Unfortunately,
4 we can't fix the cell tower and we can't fix Landing Road --
5 and or I mean 441. But you have got -- and when Jim Keane
6 has retired and that's a problem we're having. A lot of the
7 craftsmen are at or nearing retirement age. I don't know, we
8 probably have some other stucco people around, John may know
9 of some. Certainly there are other roofers around that can
10 take off the tile.

11 And I'm not sure that part of the problem with
12 the stucco is that the roof leaked, water got down between
13 the stucco and the sheathing, and that's what's partially
14 causing the problem. Because there are, as I recall, pretty
15 good overhangs on the house and I suspect that that's maybe
16 what is causing that problem.

17 ANGELA PICHICHERO: So the leaking itself of
18 the roof, that's the underlayment problem for sure. Because
19 the leaks, I have an attic, a partially finished attic and so
20 I have inside floor tarps, about over 50 percent of the
21 house, the floor. And then in heavy rains I run up there and
22 see, you know, if I need to move something or to do
23 something.

24 The stucco are exterior forces that are coming
25 from the outside. So, so, the settling, the cracks, you saw

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 the lines and it's a deep, deep overhang. Water does not
4 necessarily really get onto the house -- I mean, rain comes
5 this way. What happens is, that there are these cracks that
6 are happening as I described.

7 I mean, oh, I would love to have somebody come
8 walk around inside and out and learn this house, because what
9 I am telling you is 40 years worth of living here. Is the
10 essential deterioration of 110-year application, that has
11 never had a preservation put on it. It's never been painted.
12 It's never been varnished, it's never been never as, you
13 know, in other wood clad homes you can replace it even if
14 it's historic, you know, there are things you can do, and do
15 do. Or, you can cover it with something that's a
16 preservation material.

17 There isn't a preservation material on this
18 house. There is on 10 Hawthorne and there is on 25 Hardwood
19 Lane. So these are, it's just these are issues that are
20 relatively imminent for this house. And so, we just can't
21 ignore a flashing light here.

22 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: John?

23 MR. PAGE: I think that Angie has described
24 the situation as it is. It's a house that has the condition
25 that it has irrespective of what we do with it. So, we do

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 have access to knowledge on helping people make decisions
4 when they are confronted with rehabilitation opportunities or
5 challenges and at the time that that would come up, you know,
6 we could participate.

7 So we are not unmindful of specific situations
8 that relate to specific properties. And this property does
9 have the two conditions regarding the finishes that Angie
10 described where you have a special roof and you have a
11 special material on the siding of the house that is --

12 The other conditions are just bad luck in
13 terms of the road and the cell tower. The house and the
14 other houses that she mentioned, you know, are good examples
15 of the design, acumen of the architect. It's great to hear
16 that Roger Brown worked on your house. He has had a hand in
17 a number of historic homes where he has done a very nice, you
18 know, addition or light touch. He's sort of the man about
19 town in terms of preservation and community planning. So
20 he's, I know him very well.

21 Anyway, so I agree with what Jerry said about
22 how you've cared for the house, how you've stuck it out and
23 how it's been unfortunate that 441 is such a thoroughfare and
24 that the cell tower happened to end up there.

25 On the other hand, it's a gorgeous house. The

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 design of the house is gorgeous and Roger Brown did a great
4 job on it. I think Ken and Jerry, based on what Angie has
5 told us about her and Roger's opinion about the description
6 that it would perhaps be appropriate to share this
7 information with the consultant and attempt to get a
8 consensus on the description on the style of the house, if
9 you think that's appropriate, Ken.

10 MR. GORDON: Well, I was reading over the
11 materials and actually Cynthia Howk does mention mission
12 style.

13 MR. PAGE: Okay, good.

14 MR. GORDON: Mentioned that that Mr. Headley,
15 had a unique design and calls it Italian Renaissance style,
16 notes specifically the rough finished stucco cladding that
17 was unique to his Italian Renaissance style. And notes that
18 there are other features that fit into the Italian
19 Renaissance design, but some that do not.

20 And so I think like with any significant work
21 of art, it is unique to this artist what he brought to the
22 table to be designed as this house. And it is perhaps not
23 strictly speaking a classic Italian Renaissance design.

24 MR. PAGE: No.

25 MR. GORDON: It is a, I think both Ms. Howk

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 and Ms. Eggers Comeau would agree that it is a particularly
4 good example of a Headley style Italian Renaissance design.
5 And that is how I would phrase it in the resolution if there
6 was one that this Commission asked me to put before it.

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, if I were to drive
8 by the house Italian Renaissance is probably way down on the
9 list of what I would call it. It just doesn't make -- and
10 I'm not an architectural historian by any means, but I think
11 of the Osborne house in Victor as an Italian Renaissance
12 house or something like that, but not this house.

13 The other thing that comes to mind if Angie
14 were to sell the house, I would think she would want some
15 assurance that the future owners would do what was right with
16 the house as she has done. And, of course, that's one
17 protection that historic preservation would give the house.

18 ANGELA PICHICHERO: So I think you are
19 correct. Because you would, it would attract the person who
20 wants to participate in this type of life. It's a
21 commitment, it's a stewardship, let's call it that. They
22 would want to participate and the continuation I think this
23 house will be here for another hundred years. There is not
24 much moving it except trucks right now. But is that, the
25 duress that the house has, and so, if you could say it's

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 unfortunate and it's bad luck and it's true. It's
4 unfortunate what the roads have done and it's unfortunate
5 that the cell tower is here.

6 I am very worried with another level of stress
7 and duress, that who would chose to continue this? That's my
8 issue. Would they prefer to continue it on Hawthorne Street
9 or on Harwood Lane, or on some other designation of some
10 other place, rather than here.

11 And I don't have a huge investment in this, in
12 terms of saying, you know, it would be a shame for this
13 designation to be here. I don't think it would be a shame, I
14 consider it another stress level for the people who would
15 continue to live here or who would want to live here.
16 Because they would have a -- it's going to be expensive.
17 It's expensive to do this work, that's the bottom line.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, it would be
19 expensive no matter what you did. I mean, it would be
20 expensive to restucco it, it would be expensive to do
21 whatever. It's part of the -- we have a slate roof, that's
22 expensive. It's a part of the deal. And if people -- you're
23 either going to find one or two types of people. One, people
24 who want to live in a historic house or people who want to
25 live in a new build in Pittsford.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 So I think it's like having an old car and
4 people know me, we have several of those. And, yes, you can
5 buy a new car or you can buy an old car. Well, if you have
6 an old car you got old car problems. And if you have an old
7 house you've got old house problems, and part of our mission,
8 at least I hope it is, is to help those or assist those that
9 have older homes and making sure they find the right mechanic
10 or the right people to take care of the house.

11 MR. GOODMAN: Hey, Jerry, I had a quick
12 comment, if I could. I want to just first off to say it's I
13 think it's obvious to -- well, certainly obvious to me and
14 probably everyone else, that there's such a commitment and a
15 love that Angie has for this home. I can here it, I can hear
16 the passion, the fact that you have been here for 40 years in
17 this home that you've taken such great care of it.

18 That, first of all, that's what preservation
19 is all about. It's about the human connection and the
20 responsibility that you feel for this great resource. And
21 so, for that I just want to say on behalf of the community,
22 thank you for continuing to do what you have done.

23 I would also just point that I think that some
24 of the repairs, particularly the repair I think that you had
25 included in a photograph where you showed the previous

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 owners, this is how they repaired it, you know, they put the
4 goop in. This is how I am repairing it and the repairs that
5 you're undertaking seem to be just spot on.

6 And to Jerry's point, once we work to
7 designate this property, if it was going to be designated,
8 then, yeah, there you go, thanks. So you had mentioned on I
9 think the far left, right, Angie, about --

10 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Yes.

11 MR. GOODMAN: And then showing us the
12 treatments that you used and going and utilizing the best
13 craftsmen I think that the community can provide for this
14 amazing resource. And that's what designation would do. I
15 think moving beyond this year and future years, it really
16 makes sure that the same type of care that you provided the
17 home gets carried forward.

18 And I do believe that, you know, we see it all
19 the time, we see people who feel connected to these
20 structures, who feel a responsibility toward these
21 structures, and they understand that it's not a small price
22 tag. It happens throughout the community all of the time.

23 So that's all I have to say. I wanted to make
24 the first point to say thank you and it's an amazing
25 structure, it's a beautiful home.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Well, thank you, actually
4 and I appreciate it. And you are right and I'm sure if you
5 can hear it, is that I do truly love this house.

6 MR. GOODMAN: Right.

7 ANGELA PICHICHERO: And my family loves this
8 house, comically I didn't include it, but when they left for
9 the summer they hugged it, physically. So this is good.

10 What I am worried about is why Hawthorne, Ken
11 Hawthorne is completely painted and why 25 Harwood is
12 completely painted? Because there are circumstances where
13 you want to have the best foot forward. And, you know,
14 sometimes it's a monetary thing, but even if it isn't a
15 monetary thing, it can be a visual thing.

16 What -- is it possible that the person who
17 wants to continue to be the steward of this house that it
18 really calls for when you're here in it, would be able to
19 make those decisions that are good for it in the future? As
20 opposed to a committee that decides how and what you should
21 do.

22 MS. ROBINSON: I don't know what you mean.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, hopefully the two
24 aren't mutually exclusive. I don't know, I mean, painting
25 stucco or painting brick can have mixed results. Especially

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 if the paint doesn't breathe, that probably would compound
4 issues. Would it fill in some cracks or maybe prevent
5 some -- I don't know. I would have reservations about that.
6 I don't know.

7 John, what do you think?

8 MR. PAGE: Well, each house, and each system
9 has it's own needs. There's different ways to approach it
10 and it isn't something that we would have an answer for now.
11 It was something that would have to be considered as
12 different options based on what your goals are.

13 And so, I can't say that painting it is the
14 right answer. I can't say that painting it is the wrong
15 answer. It's something that would be evaluated when it was
16 desired to make a decision about it and it would be
17 investigated at that time.

18 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I can pretty much assure
19 you we would not approve putting vinyl siding over it.
20 Believe it or not, what just happened to a Tudor on Highland
21 Avenue, between East Avenue and 590. You'll see a Tudor
22 there with vinyl siding and it's --

23 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Yeah, you know, there are
24 sad stories, there are sad stories, and so far truly in the
25 history of this house, and you feel it when you walk in the

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 door, that this house has been loved. And it loves you back,
4 it really does give a lot.

5 And, and I would just, I have this worry that,
6 that if it feels mandated, that as we've seen in some houses,
7 then nothing gets done.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I don't think we
9 would mandate that nothing gets done. I think if there was a
10 particular issue that came up, we would look at it and
11 hopefully if we don't know we would research it to the point
12 where we would know.

13 I think that the biggest mandate is to do no
14 harm. So we have to be very careful about what we say yes
15 and no about, because in the long run, it might look like a
16 good idea to start with, but in the end run if it is harmful
17 to the house then it's not a good idea.

18 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Yes.

19 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: No harm is I think a good
20 mantra.

21 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Yes. So I, you know, I
22 put forth and, you know, I appreciate having this time to
23 tell you the important things that I think and the important
24 things that the house has spoken.

25 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, if I could reach

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 throughout the Zoom thing and pin a gold star on your
4 sweater, I would do it. I can't say enough about your
5 fortitude and your perseverance in taking care of this
6 special house.

7 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Well, thank you. And then
8 I would ask if there is anything else on the table that I can
9 contribute to?

10 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I'm fine, thank
11 you. You contributed far more than we expected and I thank
12 you for that. That's not a derogatory thing at all. I
13 really appreciate your taking the time, A, to put it in
14 writing. And also, B, putting -- or coming here -- or coming
15 there and putting it, spending your time explaining
16 everything. We appreciate it.

17 ANGELA PICHICHERO: Yes, thank you, thank you
18 for saying it, but as you know, because you do this, it's
19 very important. It's hugely important, and so I don't think
20 it should be done lightly. I don't think that it should be
21 done rubber stampy. I think it deserves a serious
22 consideration.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I agree, I agree.
24 And I don't think anyone here takes their duties lightly. We
25 all try to spend as much time as possible and we're here if

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 you need us.

4 ANGELA PICHICHERO: So, great. I think, fine,
5 and if anybody is inclined, and probably many of you are
6 inclined to drop by here, because everybody does. Seriously,
7 ask yourself that somebody who has the wherewithal and the
8 time and the energy, would they chose this house?

9 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, I think that
10 applies to pretty much any historic house. I mean, everybody
11 says location and that's certainly one thing, but that would
12 apply to any house that was there.

13 So, and we have to drive slowly because of the
14 speed bumps, so we will cruise by it. I used to live on
15 North Landing Road, so I will go by it again, and again, and
16 if you are out in the yard we will stop.

17 ANGELA PICHICHERO: So, you know, so, good.
18 Thank you for giving me this opportunity. I don't know
19 whether it's a necessary given to have this platform to
20 explain, so I appreciate that. And I'm very, very happy to
21 speak again to Cynthia Howk for example, because Roger
22 Brown -- and I think Roger Brown would like to speak to
23 Cynthia Howk and have a clarification as we go forward in any
24 permanent description of this house so that it isn't a jaw
25 dropper in your sense, it should make sense.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I hear you.

4

ANGELA PICHICHERO: Okay, so, thank you.

5

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Thank you.

6

Okay. Comments anyone? Nobody?

7

MS. DREHER: Do we need to put the -- I'm just wondering, Amanda Dreher, do we need to put the matter over to allow for a possible amendment to the application?

9

10 Because the application Mary Jo submitted does state
11 architectural style or period, Italian Renaissance. So I
12 think perhaps we need to -- the matter needs to be adjourned
13 until next time to make clarification of that.

14 But otherwise, I support the application. I
15 think the house falls within the category as Mary Jo
16 described. And it is a wonderful house, and I think by
17 designating it we will ensure that every future owner takes
18 the same care and time with the house with our support and
19 help as needed over the years, as has been done by Angie.

20 MR. GOODMAN: And, Jerry, I would support if
21 we needed to, I would certainly as Amanda suggested, I would
22 support if we needed to table this to look at the
23 definition --

24 MR. GORDON: Could I just step in here on a
25 procedural matter please? I have been sort of waiting to

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 jump in, but maybe I waited too long. So let's talk about
4 where we are procedurally folks. Right now we're in the
5 middle of a Public Hearing. We're not discussing a
6 resolution, no resolution has been put forth before this
7 Commission. No motion has been made, no motion's been
8 seconded. We're in the middle of a Public Hearing.

9 As a matter of this Public Hearing, certainly
10 this Commission could keep the Public Hearing open until its
11 next meeting. This Commission does not need to make any
12 decision or have any resolution decided tonight. There's no
13 requirement or time limit with the code that says you have to
14 have a decision made.

15 You could close the Public Hearing, but for a
16 additional submission by Katie Eggers Comeau, to clarify the
17 style of the house. You can leave it open in that way or you
18 could leave it generally open and take the matter up.

19 There's no reason to table anything, tabling
20 something would be if there was a motion or resolution before
21 the body, which there is not. So since we are in the middle
22 of the Public Hearing, it would be really the Chair's
23 prerogative to leave the Public Hearing open, or to close the
24 Public Hearing with submission of a clarification memo from
25 Katie Eggers Comeau. Relative to the style, the

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 architectural style of this home.

4 I leave that to you to discuss and then decide
5 what you want to do with the Public Hearing.

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I would suggest the
7 latter that we clarify -- we close the Public Hearing with
8 the exception of clarification by Katie as to the style of
9 the house. I don't know, how do, John, how do you feel? How
10 does everyone else feel on that one, please.

11 MR. PAGE: Yeah, I would like to close the
12 Public Hearing and move on to seeking a clarification.

13 MR. WHITAKER: I agree.

14 MS. DREHER: I agree.

15 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Diana? You're muted.

16 MS. ROBINSON: I agree. I'm just choking, I
17 turned my mute off.

18 MR. GOODMAN: That's fine with me. I guess
19 one point I was just going to make is, when I look at this
20 house and I guess I can actually, maybe I'm the odd ball out,
21 I can actually see a little bit of the Italian Renaissance
22 style in this.

23 MR. PAGE: It's there.

24 MR. GOODMAN: It is. And I can see where a
25 definition is used. It's certainly a unique style. It's

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 unique I'm sure to the architect which is one of the reasons
4 it's so incredibly, I think, significant. But certainly, I
5 see a lot of mission hanging around that style too. So I'm
6 certainly not opposed to getting clarification on that and
7 revising it.

8

9 MR. GORDON: Ramsey, I think you have a chat
10 to check. And the only other comment I was going to make was
11 there's absolutely no problem with keeping this matter on the
12 agenda for your next meeting, and then you could take this
13 matter up -- no need to table it, as I said there's nothing
14 that has been moved -- we could take it up as a matter of old
15 business at the next meeting to make a decision. So that is
16 what I think would be procedurally what we would do.

16

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Would you like a motion

18

19 to that effect?
20 MR. GORDON: No, I think it's the Chair's
21 prerogative to simply declare that the Public Hearing is
22 closed, except for the submission of a memo of clarification
23 from Katie Eggers Comeau with respect to the architectural
24 style of this home.

23

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Then I suggest that's
25 what we do.

25

MR. PAGE: Okay.

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

4

MR. WHITAKER: Thank you very much for the
5 presentation.

6

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Oh, yes, thank you,
7 Angie.

8

ANGELA PICHICHERO: You're welcome. And thank
9 you for the opportunity, and so I'm going to cut out. I'm --

10

MR. GORDON: Right. We will not be taking
11 action tonight.

12

ANGELA PICHICHERO: Okay, thank you.

13

MR. PAGE: Thank you.

14

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: We have no certificates
15 of appropriateness, no hardship applications, Public Hearings
16 are closed.

17

New business, any new business?

18

Old business, 909 North Landing Road. We had
19 some clarification on that, Mary Jo, I think. That there are
20 basically the original school house, then there was the
21 addition, and also the -- Parish residents, and do we want to
22 proceed with that? Have we sent a letter?

23

MR. BOEHNER: Yes, we did send a letter, met
24 with representatives of the church today via Zoom. Got a
25 bunch of questions about issues of maintenance, landscaping,

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 their roof, replacement of a window. I'm just trying to
4 understand how the process works. They also were thinking
5 about maybe selling off the home, and wanted to know if
6 designation would impact that. The report does say that the
7 home is not a distinguishing feature of the property.

8 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Right.

9 MR. BOEHNER: But if you subdivide it you
10 would be altering the property. So there's a number of
11 things they brought up. They do have to go back to their
12 congregation and the larger congregation in the Rochester
13 area just to get approval. They have no position at this
14 time because they were not in a position to say they support
15 the application or not. But they will be talking about it
16 and following back up with us.

17 So we are in a position if you did want to
18 schedule this for a Public Hearing, we could do that for the
19 October meeting, if you like. I don't see a reason why not.

20 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay.

21 MS. LANPHEAR: I did tell them about the
22 sacred sites program of the New York Landmarks Conservancy
23 and that was another thing that might be helpful to them.

24 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Have you met with them,
25 Mary Jo?

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 MS. LANPHEAR: We met today, Ramsey and I
4 met --

5 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay, you were a part of
6 that meeting. Great.

7 MS. DREHER: Did it seem like they would have
8 enough time to go through the channels they were talking
9 about to get feedback? Is a month going to be enough time
10 for them if we set the Public Hearing for next month? I
11 wouldn't want to prevent them from doing their due diligence
12 and they need to talk to with the congregation?

13 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Well, it's common for
14 people to ask for an extension whenever we put something on
15 the agenda.

16 MS. DREHER: Okay. So if they need it they
17 will ask for it?

18 MR. BOEHNER: And with our policies of adopted
19 by the Commission, I do have that authority to grant those
20 adjournments once for reason, if it pops up.

21 MS. DREHER: Okay.

22 MR. BOEHNER: I did tell them, Amanda, that it
23 is the next step would could be that the Board could schedule
24 the Public Hearing for the October meeting. I did say that
25 to them. I did explain to them that it was if you felt that

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2

3 the property was worthy of designation, it was really your
4 obligation as a Commission to designate it. We understand
5 the powers that you have.

6

7 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Maybe we should go ahead
8 and set the Public Hearing, and then if there's a reason to
9 postpone it for a month, we ca do it, otherwise we can move
ahead.

10

MR. BOEHNER: Okay.

11

12 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: What do you think about
that?

13

MS. DREHER: Sounds good.

14

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: John, David, okay.

15

MS. ROBINSON: Sounds good.

16

17 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Do you want to call a
vote on that, Ramsey?

18

MR. BOEHNER: Yes, let me just write a note.

19

This is to schedule a Public Hearing to consider designation.

20

Did I have a motion on that?

21

MS. DREHER: I will move.

22

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Second.

23

MR. WHITAKER: Second.

24

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: David seconds.

25

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Ludwig?

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson?

MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Whitaker?

MR. WHITAKER: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

MR. PAGE: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

MS. DREHER: Yes.

MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes. We will get the item scheduled for the October meeting.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: At one time on 1037 South Winton, Bill, I think was going to speak with someone of the congregation. I don't know if that has happened or not. Do you know, Ramsey?

MR. BOEHNER: Last time I talked to him it had not, and I don't think it's happened since because they are in the holidays.

CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. I guess I would like to have --

MR. BOEHNER: And there was something else I

1 Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

2
3 wanted to talk with him about and he just said right now is
4 not the time to go be talking to them. That is the latest, I
5 did bring it up to him again.

6 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay. I would --

7 MR. BOEHNER: Ken, do you have any update on
8 that by any chance?

9 MR. GORDON: No. I have the same knowledge
10 you do. What I might suggest, Ramsey, is maybe make a note
11 for yourself to bring it up at one of your Friday meetings.
12 Maybe not this Friday as it is the Friday before Yom Kippur
13 but maybe the following Friday.

14 MR. BOEHNER: I think you're right. I think
15 if I brought it up again he would wonder if I'm not hearing
16 him, I brought it up last Friday.

17 MR. GORDON: I can pester the man like a
18 champ.

19 MR. BOEHNER: Oh, I'm good at pestering him,
20 I'm just saying I will pass this Friday and I'm going to put
21 it on for a Friday a couple weeks down the road. I have to
22 be careful in using my pestering to a minimum.

23 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: I suggest we hold off on
24 that until Bill's had a chance to --

25 MR. BOEHNER: Yes.

Brighton Historic Preservation Commission 09/24/2020

1
2
3 MR. GORDON: He has a lot going on and a lot
4 of his attention has been focused the last month, not just on
5 COVID, but the budget. And that's been a huge burden on him
6 and they finally pulled together a budget that will work, as
7 ugly as it is. But so, yes, it's not -- I don't think he is
8 disinterested, I don't think that it's that he doesn't see
9 the importance of this matter, I think it's just there are
10 other things that have been in the way.

11 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: Okay, that's fine.

12 Any other old business?

13 May I have a motion to adjourn?

14 MS. ROBINSON: I move to adjourn.

15 MR. GOODMAN: I will second.

16 CHAIRPERSON LUDWIG: All in favor?

17 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

18 * * *

19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

REPORTER CERTIFICATE

I, Rhoda Collins, do hereby certify that I did report in stenotype machine shorthand the proceedings held in the above-entitled matter;

Further, that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate transcription of my said stenographic notes taken at the time and place hereinbefore set forth.

Dated this 20th day of October, 2020.

At Rochester, New York

Rhoda Collins
Rhoda Collins