

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

PROCEEDINGS HELD BEFORE THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION
COMMISSION OF BRIGHTON AT 2300 ELMWOOD AVENUE, ROCHESTER, NEW
YORK ON SEPTEMBER 26TH, 2019 AT APPROXIMATELY 7:15 P.M.

September 26th, 2019
Brighton Town Hall
2300 Elmwood Avenue
Rochester, New York 14618

PRESENT:

JOHN PAGE, Acting Chairperson.
WAYNE GOODMAN
AMANDA L. DREHER
DIANA ROBINSON

MARY JO LANPHEAR
Town Historian

KEN GORDON, ESQ.
Town Attorney

RAMSEY A. BOEHNER
Town Planner

NOT PRESENT:
JERRY LUDWIG
JUSTIN DELVECCHIO
DAVID WHITAKER

REPORTED BY: RHODA COLLINS, Court Reporter
FORBES COURT REPORTING SERVICES, LLC
21 Woodcrest Drive
Batavia, New York 14020

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2
3 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: I'd like to call the
4 meeting to order. Would you call the roll please, Ramsey?

5 MR. BOEHNER: Absent is Ludwig, Delvecchio,
6 and Whitaker.

7 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: May I have an approval of
8 the agenda please?

9 MR. GOODMAN: I make a motion to approve the
10 agenda.

11 MS. ROBINSON: I'll second it.

12 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: All in favor?

13 ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

14 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Stands approved. Anyone
15 take a look at the minutes from August 29th?

16 MS. DREHER: Yes, I have a couple of
17 corrections. Page 9, Line 24, it states, and the big move we
18 would like to make there is to at least turn that into a
19 condition space. Condition isn't the right word, does anyone
20 recall what the right word would be?

21 MS. LANPHEAR: What page?

22 MS. DREHER: Page 9, Line 24.

23 MS. DREHER: This is regarding that
24 international style house and the big move that we would like
25 to make there is to at least turn that into a condition

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2
3 space.

4 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

5 MS. DREHER: Is that correct?

6 MS. ROBINSON: I think they're enclosing their
7 porch.

8 MS. DREHER: Okay. And the next, it says we
9 would primarily be reconstructing it. It was pretty root
10 measured when it was built. What do you think, root, is not
11 the right word.

12 MS. ROBINSON: Rough framed, maybe.

13 MS. DREHER: Okay. So substitute rough for
14 root at Line 25, Page 9.

15 On Page 11, Lines 20, 23, 24, there's mention
16 of the term homes oak several times. Let me give an example,
17 the studio addition which is on the left here right now is
18 clad and homes oak. Is homes oak right?

19 MR. DELVECCHIO: Homesote, that's what it was.

20 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: H-O-M-E-S-O-T-E, that's the
21 Page spelling.

22 MS. DREHER: There are three mentions of that
23 in Line 20, 23, 24.

24 Page 18, Line 25, it says chesses and it
25 should be C-H-A-I-S-E-S.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2

3

Page 33, Line 18, it is Cynthia Howk, H-O-W-K

4

I think the record said H-O-W-A.

5

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: It's also on Page 5,

6

Line 10.

7

MS. DREHER: Okay. Last one, Page 37,

8

Line 6, go should be vote. That was me stating that I cannot

9

vote on the certificate of appropriateness regarding the

10

Landmark Society because I'm on the Board.

11

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: I will add on Page 5,

12

Line 17, I believe where the word credible is it should be

13

critical.

14

MS. LANPHEAR: Yes.

15

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Any others? Can we get a

16

motion to approve the minutes as amended?

17

MS. DREHER: I will move.

18

MS. ROBINSON: Second.

19

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: All in favor.

20

ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

21

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Minutes are approved as

22

amended. Thank you.

23

Has the meeting been duly advertised?

24

MR. BOEHNER: Yes, it was properly advertised

25

in the Brighton Pittsford Post of September 12, 2019.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2
3 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Okay. The meeting as
4 advertised will now be held.

5 No communications, no destination of
6 landmarks, we have one certificate of appropriateness,
7 9H-01-19 Application of Marjorie B. Searl, owner of property
8 at 124 Summit Drive, Tax Number 136.07-1-5.11 for a
9 certificate of appropriateness to replace windows on the
10 northwest corner of the house. All as described in
11 application and documents on file.

12 Is there anyone here to speak on that
13 application? If you could come forward and state your name
14 and possibly spell it if necessary.

15 CHRIS GIONTA: I'm Chris Gionta, G-I-O-N-T-A
16 with Rochester Colonial. He's looking to replace the two
17 twin casements and I believe it's the back, second floor
18 office. Right now they are wood casements and the frames are
19 severally rotted. That's why we're looking to do the
20 Integrity product, which is a rot-resistance material, it's a
21 fiberglass on the outside and it is a wood window on the
22 inside, and once these go in his plans are to paint the
23 window. So to give you that same look and carry that through
24 the rest of the windows in the home.

25 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: But this application is to

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2

3 just for the windows identified in this application?

4 CHRIS GIONTA: Correct. There's two twin
5 casements, that's all we are doing.

6 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Is this a product that will
7 be installed in the existing frame?

8 CHRIS GIONTA: No. The existing frames are
9 rotted so they need to be replaced.

10 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: The frame and sash will be
11 removed?

12 CHRIS GIONTA: Correct.

13 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: And the replacement windows
14 will fit into the opening as it exists?

15 CHRIS GIONTA: Correct.

16 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: And with the same operation
17 in terms of casement versus casement and so?

18 CHRIS GIONTA: Yes.

19 MS. ROBINSON: They are custom built to the
20 exact size?

21 CHRIS GIONTA: Correct. Made to fit the
22 openings.

23 MR. GOODMAN: I did make note in the
24 application that these are paintable and the paint will match
25 the existing windows.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2
3 CHRIS GIONTA: Exactly right.

4 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Any other questions? Okay.
5 Anything you would like to add?

6 CHRIS GIONTA: No.

7 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Could we have a motion?

8 MR. GORDON: No. Are you closing the Public
9 Hearing?

10 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: The Public Hearing is now
11 closed.

12 MR. GORDON: Would you like a motion?

13 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Please.

14 MR. GORDON: I would ask one of the members to
15 make the following motion, whereas Application 9H-01-19 has
16 been submitted for a certificate of appropriateness under the
17 Town's Historic Preservation Law for improvements to property
18 located at 124 Summit Drive, owned by Marjorie,
19 M-A-R-J-O-R-I-E, Searl, S-E-A-R-L, to perform work as
20 described as the replacement of two wood-framed twin casement
21 windows on the northwest corner of the second floor with
22 Integrity fiberglass window frames to match the look of the
23 existing windows. And whereas the Historic Preservation
24 Commission duly called the Public Hearing to consider the
25 matter on September 26, 2019. And whereas the necessary

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2

3

legal notice was published and a required sign posted

4

pursuant to Town Code. And whereas the Public Hearing was

5

held and all persons having an interest in such matter having

6

had an opportunity to be heard therein. And whereas the

7

Historic Preservation Commission hereby determines pursuant

8

to the factors set forth in Section 224-5 of the Town Code

9

that the proposed above described work to the subject

10

properties consistent with the purposes of the Town's

11

Historic Preservation law and compatible with the property's

12

historic character based upon it's review of the application

13

and documents on file, and received at the Public Hearing and

14

the testimony presented at the Public Hearing.

15

It is therefore hereby resolved that the

16

Historic Preservation Commission receives and files the above

17

described application and all of the supporting materials and

18

it is further resolved that the Historic Preservation

19

Commission hereby approves Application 9H-01-19 for the

20

certificate of appropriateness for the above described work

21

to be performed at the property located at 124 Submit Drive,

22

in the Town of Brighton. Subject to the condition that the

23

above described work be completed within one year from the

24

date of the approval. Any other conditions?

25

MS. ROBINSON: Painted.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2
3 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: You are saying that the
4 sash will be painted.

5 MR. GORDON: And also upon the condition that
6 the sash will be painted to match the existing windows.

7 MS. DREHER: Can we do that?

8 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: They offered to do that.

9 MR. BOEHNER: And you are not choosing the
10 color.

11 MS. DREHER: Okay.

12 MR. GORDON: Anything else?

13 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Any discussion? Would
14 somebody like to make that motion?

15 MS. DREHER: I will make a motion.

16 MS. ROBINSON: I will second.

17 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Now, is there any
18 discussion? There's no discussion. Will you call the roll
19 for us?

20 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman.

21 MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

22 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

23 MR. PAGE: Yes.

24 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson.

25 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2

3

MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

4

MS. DREHER: Yes.

5

MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes with conditions.

6

Thank you for coming.

7

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: There's no hardship

8

applications, the Public Hearings are closed.

9

There's no new business listed. Is there any

10

new business from the members? Old business, 3225 East

11

Avenue, this is the house that's been updated and is sort of

12

in the cue. And so I'd suggest that we start the process, is

13

there any opinion on that?

14

MS. DREHER: I think it's definitely worthy of

15

the designation, so I believe we move forward with the

16

sending of the letter.

17

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Would you like to make that

18

motion?

19

MS. DREHER: I would.

20

MR. GORDON: Do you want a formal motion or do

21

you want an informal motion?

22

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Let's do it informally.

23

MR. GORDON: That's fine.

24

MS. DREHER: I would move to send the owners,

25

the Graystones, a letter indicating that we are considering

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2
3 designation as a landmark.

4 MR. GOODMAN: I will second that motion.

5 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Robinson?

6 MS. ROBINSON: Yes.

7 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Goodman?

8 MR. GOODMAN: Yes.

9 MR. BOEHNER: Mr. Page.

10 MR. PAGE: Yes.

11 MR. BOEHNER: Ms. Dreher?

12 MS. DREHER: Yes.

13 MR. BOEHNER: Motion passes.

14 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: So I'm not sure what we
15 have in the cue at this point. Anybody have any thoughts on
16 that? We ought to be putting something in the cue. I think
17 Ramsey, can you confirm that we don't have any other new or
18 updated?

19 MR. BOEHNER: I was just wondering myself.

20 MS. LANPHEAR: August 28th, we have a list
21 from August of this year, surveyed but not designated.

22 MR. GORDON: Did we designate 30 Stoneham?

23 MR. BOEHNER: Yes, and they will be back in
24 next month.

25 MR. GORDON: What's the cutoff for that

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2
3 meeting, Ramsey?

4 MR. BOEHNER: I don't have a calendar with me,
5 it could be this week?

6 MR. GORDON: Are no applications in yet?

7 MR. BOEHNER: That, I don't know. They
8 called, they were wanting to try to get in this meeting, I
9 had to explain we could not run the public notice, time had
10 passed. We're working on getting them in the next meeting.

11 MR. GORDON: The reason for my inquiries is I
12 will not be at the October meeting.

13 MR. BOEHNER: It's a C of A meeting, it's not
14 a designation.

15 MR. GORDON: I'm fibbing, I will be here.

16 Are you still working through the list to
17 narrow the list?

18 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: I think we completed that
19 process of going through the ones, agreeing, 80 percent of
20 the group that we had.

21 MR. GORDON: So the list I have is as of
22 July 25, 2019? Do you think that is the --

23 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Yes, except the Glen
24 Road --

25 MS. LANPHEAR: The Stan house?

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2
3 MR. GORDON: 69 Glen Road?

4 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: I have listed as having
5 been removed, it would have been after that time, but don't
6 take my word.

7 MS. LANPHEAR: I don't remember.

8 MR. GORDON: Ramsey, do you know if it was
9 further updated?

10 MR. BOEHNER: I don't know, I don't have that.
11 I have older ones, I cleaned out my binder. I think this is
12 probably the last one, to be honest with you.

13 MS. LANPHEAR: We had discussed some of these
14 houses.

15 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: There wasn't another update
16 after this?

17 MS. LANPHEAR: No.

18 MR. GORDON: I agree. You're just saying you
19 think there ought to be, for example, 30 Stoneham is here,
20 that should come off the list now because it is. Now, 69
21 Glen Road you think was removed from the list?

22 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: I have it on my cheat sheet
23 here as --

24 MR. GORDON: We should be able to find that in
25 the minutes and they would have been in the minutes for the

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2
3 August meeting I believe.

4 MS. DREHER: The three on Winton Road --

5 MR. GORDON: Do we have the August minutes?

6 MR. BOEHNER: Yes.

7 MS. DREHER: The last three on the list on
8 Winton Road, I don't have notes on those.

9 MS. LANPHEAR: We didn't talk about those, I
10 don't believe.

11 MS. DREHER: I have everything through the
12 Westfall Road which is the Jalna house.

13 MR. GOODMAN: I don't remember the Winton.

14 MS. DREHER: I don't think we got to those.

15 MS. LANPHEAR: The 1356 I believe is an
16 arts-and-crafts looking house. They got a new porch on it
17 recently. 1495 is across the road is almost to the corner of
18 Westfall, it's a very old wooden house associated with the
19 brickyards.

20 MR. GORDON: Your point is that maybe the
21 surveys should be sent out for those last three so the Board
22 can look at them?

23 MS. DREHER: Yes.

24 MS. LANPHEAR: 1037 is owned by the religion
25 congregation.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2
3 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Right.

4 MS. DREHER: I have a note on that, it is rare
5 Buckland brick, is that correct, 1037?

6 MS. LANPHEAR: That's a Chabad Lubavitch.

7 MS. ROBINSON: Across from the high school?

8 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes. It's an interesting
9 looking house, it sits quite a ways back from the road.

10 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: How are we on funds? Have
11 we expended our funds for the year to the point where we
12 shouldn't consider anymore?

13 MR. BOEHNER: I'm sorry?

14 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: I was wondering if we had
15 expended as much money as we should for this time of year.

16 MR. BOEHNER: I can check that. We saved some
17 money, and I believe it would have been for a destination. I
18 believe we might have been running a little tight.

19 MR. GORDON: My recollection would be that we
20 have enough money to do one full survey. I assume all of
21 these if you pick one off of this list will simply be
22 updated. So we certainly have enough to pick up one of
23 these. You are almost at October.

24 MR. BOEHNER: We need to order that up before
25 the end of the year.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2

3

4

5

6

7

MR. GORDON: Yes. I think you ought to be considering if there's money to do one, you do one; if there's money to do two updates, you do two updates. But you ought to do that perhaps make that decision if not now, at the October meeting at the latest.

8

9

10

11

12

13

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: So I'd be happy if we picked two properties, at lease one or two off the list. So that we could work on the list a little more. And if anybody wanted to put -- there's a couple on the list that we are keeping on the list even though there's a hesitation to have them on the list. I would suggest not going after those.

14

15

16

MS. LANPHEAR: What's the status of 2133 Westfall, Jalna house. Is that one that was kept on the list or discarded?

17

18

19

20

MS. DREHER: I think it was kept on the list. I was going to look up the minutes because that day there was one I said on the record that I thought would be worthy of an update. I don't recall which one.

21

22

MS. ROBINSON: I think we didn't have enough people, so I said no.

23

24

MS. DREHER: I don't think it came off the list. I don't remember which one.

25

MS. ROBINSON: Something procedural.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2
3 MS. LANPHEAR: 3333 Elmwood Avenue is, I think
4 it was kept on the list too. That's the one on the corner of
5 Elmwood and Clover, southeast corner of Elmwood and Clover.
6 Ray Burchfield house, which may be a bit of controversy.

7 MR. BOEHNER: Oh, it will be.

8 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: I believe we kept the Jalna
9 house. We also -- there was maybe one house that -- no, that
10 1890 to 1940 was the one I have listed here as retained.

11 MR. GORDON: Ramsey, how difficult would it be
12 for you to grab copies of the minutes from August and July?

13 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Mary Jo, are there a couple
14 of these on here you say you think are not particularly
15 controversial? The Chabad, I think we've sort of decided we
16 wouldn't push that since it's a religious organization and
17 they were reluctant.

18 MS. LANPHEAR: Were they reluctant or we just
19 kind of said we will leave them alone?

20 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: They were reluctant, my
21 memory.

22 MS. LANPHEAR: I know Ray Burchfield at
23 3333 --

24 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: I was not on this Board at
25 the time. They came in to the Board I was on and their

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2
3 initial conversation with us was, we don't really have to
4 come to you but we are as a courtesy. And we've talked to
5 Arlene, and they sort of made the decision for instance to go
6 with the addition with clapboard instead of brick to
7 distinguish it. I think they thought that was a great idea
8 because it was less money.

9 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes.

10 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: And --

11 MR. GORDON: So not August, how about July?

12 MR. BOEHNER: What are you looking for?

13 MR. GORDON: Looking for Amanda's comments.

14 MS. DREHER: We talked about the nursery
15 school. There's some I believe that might have been one.

16 MS. LANPHEAR: I believe we kept it.

17 MR. BOEHNER: No, we took the nursery school
18 off.

19 MS. DREHER: That was the one I was talking
20 about. There was -- you felt strongly about that and I think
21 you felt strongly the other way. So I said, I'm kind of
22 thinking we keep it on the list and if the budget allows, get
23 an updated survey, unless you get some additional information
24 in making a decision. So I said I would keep it on the list
25 for that purpose. I don't know how we feel today about that.

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2
3 MS. ROBINSON: Mary Jo said something about a
4 bus.

5 MS. LANPHEAR: I would throw myself in front
6 of a bus.

7 MS. DREHER: There have been some substantial
8 changes to that, I guess.

9 MS. LANPHEAR: 1140 Clover Street has been
10 surveyed and I have a huge folder on it. It's the Finucane
11 family and it's a nice stucco and brick Tudor revival house
12 on Clover Street. It might be worth considering for the next
13 house. I don't think it would be very controversial.

14 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Would we like to either
15 make a decision tonight or bring it up at the next meeting to
16 have that updated?

17 MR. GOODMAN: This property that you
18 mentioned?

19 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes, 1140 Clover, it belonged
20 to the Finucane family.

21 MR. GOODMAN: It's been surveyed?

22 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes. We would need an update,
23 or has it been updated? Do I have it with me? No, I don't
24 have it with me. Let me check, let me look and see.

25 MR. BOEHNER: Do you want me to put down the

1 Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

2
3 1140 Clover Street on the agenda?

4 MS. LANPHEAR: Yes, please.

5 MR. GOODMAN: So is Ramsey going to check and
6 see if the survey has been updated and if that survey has not
7 been updated, is that one we would like to pursue?

8 MR. BOEHNER: We will talk about it at the
9 next meeting. I'm going to send you whatever I have and then
10 we can tell if we want an update. I'm also going to check
11 the budget to see how much money we have and let people know
12 how much we have, what our budget is.

13 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: So be thinking about --

14 MR. BOEHNER: I'm also going to be sending
15 surveys out for 1037, 1356, and 1495 Winton Road.

16 MS. DREHER: Yes.

17 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: -- be thinking about any
18 other properties in case we have the money for updates, for a
19 second update.

20 MS. LANPHEAR: Okay.

21 CHAIRPERSON PAGE: So we can keep some things
22 in the cue moving forward.

23 Okay. Any presentations? Any announcements?
24 If there's no other discussion, I'll call the meeting to an
25 end.

Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton 09/26/19

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

MS. DREHER: I will move.

MR. GOODMAN: Second.

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: All in favor.

ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIRPERSON PAGE: Thank you all.

* * *

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

REPORTER CERTIFICATE

I, Rhoda Collins, do hereby certify that I did report in stenotype machine shorthand the proceedings held in the above-entitled matter;

Further, that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate transcription of my said stenographic notes taken at the time and place hereinbefore set forth.

Dated this 28th day of October, 2019.

At Rochester, New York


Rhoda Collins