

Proceedings held before the Historic Preservation Commission of Brighton at 2300 Elmwood Avenue, Rochester, New York held September 27, 2018 commencing at approximately 7:30 p.m.

PRESENT: Jerry Ludwig  
John Page  
Diana Robinson  
Amanda Dreher  
Wayne Goodman  
Justin DelVecio

NOT PRESENT: David Whitaker

Mary Jo Lanphear, Town Historian  
Ramsey Boehner, Secretary/Town Planner  
Kenneth W. Gordon, Town Attorney

FIRE ALARM PROCEDURES WERE ANNOUNCED

MR. CHAIRMAN: I would like to call the September 27, 2018 meeting to order. The first order of business is approving the agenda. I would ask for a motion to approve the agenda.

MR. PAGE: I so move.

MR. GOODMAN : Second.

UPON ROLL CALL VOTE MOTION UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED

John Page	Yes	Wayne Goodman	Yes
Diana Robinson	Yes	Jerry Ludwig	Yes
Amada Dreher	Yes	Justin DelVecchio	Yes

---

MR. CHAIRMAN: We don't have any minutes for the August 23, 2018 meeting so we will vote on that next month. Was this meeting duly advertised?

---

MR. BOEHNER: Yes, this meeting was duly advertised in the Brighton Pittsford Post of September 6, 2018.

---

MR. CHAIRMAN: That meeting as duly advertised with now be held.

---

COMMUNICATIONS

NONE

---

DESIGNATION OF LANDMARKS

9H-01-2018 Application of Mary Jo Lanphear, Town Historian, for property owned by Rufus and Amy Judson at 3541 Elmwood Avenue, tax number 137.23-3-25, for landmark designation. All as described on application and documents on file.

MS. JUDSON: Amy Judson I live at 3541 Elmwood Avenue. My husband is away on business and I just want to speak on where I am coming from. My husband and I did meet with Mr. Boehner and Mr. Ludwig and Mr. Gordon and I am going to give you a little history on this. We made a deal on the house in the end of May and didn't close until July and throughout the whole process we never heard about this becoming a historic property, neither the Realtor or the sellers said anything and it came as shock the week after we closed when we got a letter and we weren't happy when we got it. We didn't want to do anything radical to the house but we were not told this was a historic property and they didn't disclose any information. We did get proof that they had gotten a letter saying it was going through and we feel that should have been disclosed not because we wanted to do any radical changes on the house but I am not sure we would have spent the money we wanted to spend if there were restrictions on things like that. We live in America and we don't want to be told what we can and can not do with such things as doors and windows. So in buying this and feeling all these fears and frustration we met with the three gentlemen and Ms. Lanphear who was also there and we feel a little bit better after leaving that meeting that not all of our requests would be squashed. We did show some ideas of some doors and some windows that we wanted to do, currently it is single pained and it is definitely not good for Rochester winters. We would not want to change all of those windows because they are beautiful

but definitely the bedroom windows and things like that. But anyways they calmed our fears on that and they were very easy to work with and we didn't see any problems in the ideas that we had shown. So I guess that is where I am. Thank you.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Basically we did meet and we said we would look at any proposals one at a time but we certainly didn't see anything too radical that they proposed. So when you get ready to do something let's talk.

MR. GORDON: And I think we would have all felt more comfortable if your sellers had told you it might be designated because they had gotten a letter before you closed and made a decision before you closed on it based on that as to whether you wanted the house and hopefully you would have wanted to buy the house and be the caretakers of that property.

MS. HUDSON: We bought it because we loved that property.

MR. GORDON: And it would have been a whole lot better had you known.

MS. HUDSON: And I would want to thank the Town of Brighton for putting our fears to rest.

MR. CHAIRMAN: At the last meeting you said you might want to table this for another month.

MR. GORDON: No their attorney called me and I am sorry I didn't mention that but they were thinking about putting things off and hiring their own consultant but they decided not to do that and not to ask that the matter be put off for another month.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Anybody else to speak about this, Mary Jo do you have anything to add?

MS. LANPHEAR: I did pass out a memo regarding this property and it does fulfill all four of the criteria for designation.

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is a great house. Any questions from the commission? The board noticed it was a concrete exterior made to look like stone. I would love to take a look at it sometime. Any comments or questions? I would like to close the public hearing. Do you have a motion you would like to put forth so we can proceed.

MR. GORDON: Thank you Jerry, I would propose the following motion to be made by one of the members of the commission.

WHEREAS application 9H-01-18 has been submitted for designation of 3541 Elmwood Avenue in the Town of Brighton, County of Monroe, State of New York, tax account number 137.12-2-15 as a landmark under the Town's Historic Preservation Law.

AND WHEREAS, the Historic Preservation Commission duly called a public hearing to consider such designation and the public hearing was duly held on September 27, 2018 and all persons having an interest in such matter having had an opportunity to be heard therein.

AND WHEREAS based upon materials submitted prior to the hearing of the public hearing including the September 27, 2018 memorandum from Mary Jo Lanphear, the Town of Brighton Historian, the July 17, 2018 memorandum from Mary Jo Lanphear the Town of Brighton Historian, and the undated clippings and supplemental information about the property at 3541 Elmwood Avenue submitted by Katty Cuomo from Farrell Architects together with the historic resources and inventory survey completed in July of 2018 by Farrell Architects on behalf of the Historic Preservation Commission and the original application of Mary Jo Lanphear and the testimony heard at such hearing

The Historic Preservation Commission hereby finds that the subject property possesses such historic value based upon the factors setforth In May Jo Lanphears 2018 memorandum summarizing those factors for the Commission

THEREFORE IT IS HEREBY RESOLVED that the Town of Brighton's application 9H-01-18 be designated as a landmark of the property located

at 3541 Elmwood Avnue in the Town of Brighton, County of Monroe and State of NewYorkTax parcel 137.12-2-15 together with all of the above referenced materials is hereby received and filed by the Historic Preservation Commission.

AND BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Town of Brighton's Historic Preservation Commission hereby designates the above referenced subject property located at 3541 Elmwood Avenue as a historic landmark pursuant to Chapter 224 of Town Code based upon the Commission's Historic articulate findings of the subject property.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Thank you, would someone like to put forth the motion?

MS DREHER: So moved.

MS. ROBINSON: Second.

UPON ROLL CALL VOTE MOTION UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED

Mr. Page	Yes	Mr. Goodman	Yes
Ms. Dreher	Yes	Mr. DelVecchio	Yes
Mr. Ludwig	Yes	Ms. Robinson	Yes

---

#### CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

9H-02-18 Application of Mark McCarthy, owner of property at 2550 East Avenue, tax number 122.20-3-3, for a certificate of appropriateness to modify previously approved application 2H-01-18 to install French Doors. All as described on application and documents on file.

MR. MCCARTHY: Mark McCarthy 2550 East Avenue.

MR. CHAIRMAN: We have approved as I remember a wooden French door. And you want to make that a steel door.

MR. MCCARTHY: The outside is PVC.

MR. PAGE: It is a clad wood door is that not right, so it's a wood door with a PVC coating on the outside. In our business we call that a wood door with a PVC coating on the outside. It is a wooden structure with a weather resistant coating whereas if it is an all PVC door it makes a difference. It is a little less appropriate and a little less durable in my opinion.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Any other questions?

MR. GOODMAN: Other than I just agree with everything John said. Except because it has that girth it holds up so much better and aesthetically it is much more pleasing.

MR. CHAIRMAN: So this will be its appearance on the outside other than if you paint it.

MR. MCCARTHY: Yes.

MR. CHAIRMAN: So this looks like it has the grills on both the outside and the inside. They are not removable they are affixed to the door?

MR. MCCARTHY: Yes.

MR. CHAIRMAN: And it is an Andersen Door?

MR. MCCARTHY: Yes.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Any questions? I have just one not having to do with the door. Are there any gates in this fence?

MR. MCARTHY: Yes.

MR. GORDON: Can somebody give me a short rendition of what this for?

MR. CHAIRMAN: We are just talking about the door itself.

MR. BOEHNER: It is a modification of a previously approved certificate of appropriateness to 2H-01-18. We have to go through the formal process to get a C of A and that is where we are right now.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I would say the applicant is replacing the wood door with a clad unit by Andersen with simulated divided light. Any thing else? Public hearings are closed. Would you like to prepare a motion?

MR. GORDON: Yes.

WHEREAS application 9H-02-18 has been submitted for a certificate of appropriateness under the Town's Historic Preservation Law for a modification to a previously approved certificate of appropriateness Application 2H-01-18 relating to property located at 2550 East Avenue in the Town of Brighton, County of Monroe and State of New York tax number 122.20-3-3, for work described as replacement of the previously approved French doors with Andersen door model number F W H 50 68.

AND WHEREAS the Historic Preservation Commission duly called A public hearing to consider the matter on September 27, 2018 .

AND WHEREAS the necessary legal notice was published and required sign posted pursuant to Town Code .

AND WHEREAS the public hearings were held and all persons having an interest in such matter having had an opportunity to be heard therein

AND WHEREAS the Historic Preservation Commission hereby determines pursuant to the factors set forth in Section 224-5 of the Town Code that the proposed above described work to the subject property is consistent with the purposes of the Town's Historic Preservation Law and compatible with the properties historic character based upon its review of the application and documents on file and received at the public hearing with the testimony and materials presented at the public hearing

IT IS HEREBY RESOLVED that the Historic Preservation Commission hereby receives and files the above described application and supporting

documentation including this purchase order from Morse Sach and Door Company regarding the Andersen windows and door model number F W H 50 68

AND IT IS FURTHER RESOVED that the Historic Preservation Commission approves application 9H-02-18 for a certificate of appropriateness modifying the previously issued certificate of appropriateness on application 2H-01-18 as requested in the present application subject to the condition that the above described work be completed within one year from the date of approval and subject further to the condition that the door to be installed as identified in the Morse Sach and Door Company now received and filed by the Commission.

And Be It Further Resolved that pursuant to Chapter 224 of the Town Code the above described work qualifies for the exemptions set forth in the property tax law Section 441-a.

MR. PAGE: I will make that motion.

MR. GOODMAN: Second.

UPON ROLL CALL VOTE MOTION CARRIED

John Page	Yes	Mr. Goodman	Yes
Jerry Ludwig	Yes	Justin DelVecchio	Yes
Amada Dreher	Yes	Ms. Robinson	Yes

---

HARDSHIP APPLICATION

NONE

---

MR. CHAIRMAN: The public hearings are closed.

---

NEW BUSINESS

NONE

---



OLD BUSINESS

285 Council Rock

2351 East Avenue

MR. BOEHNER: Send out first letter, did not hear back, recommendation is to wait one month until the Secretary is available.

---

PRESENTATIONS

NONE

---

ANNOUNCEMENTS

NONE

---

MR. CHAIRMAN: Can I have a motion to adjourn?

MR. DREHER: So moved.

MR. GOODMAN: Second.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The meeting is adjourned.

\* \* \* \* \*


CERTIFICATION

I, Judy Almekinder, 7633 Bauer Van Wickle Road, Lyons, New York 14489, do hereby state that the minutes of the September 27, 2018 meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission at 2300 Elmwood Avenue, Brighton, New York, is a true and accurate transcription of those notes to the best of my ability as recorded and transcribed by me.



Judy Almekinder

On this 2 day of October in the year 2018, before me personally came Judy Almekinder to me known, and known to me to be the person described herein and who executed the foregoing instrument, and she acknowledges to me that she executed the same.



Notary Public

TANYA J. LEISENRING  
Notary Public, State of New York  
Qualified in Wayne County  
No. 01LE6312991  
Commission Expires October 14, 2018

Commission Expires October 14, 2011  
No. 01E6312991  
Qualified in Wayne County  
Notary Public, State of New York  
TAMARA J. LEINENBERG